

Performance Notes on **Carl Nielsen's**  
***Koncert For Klarinet Og Orkester, Opus 57***  
by  
Eric Nelsen

Eric Nelson is clarinetist with The Lightwood Duo, an actively touring clarinet/guitar duo. Their CDs are available through their website, <http://www.lightwoodduo.com>.

as recorded in study with **Tage Scharff**, Professor of Clarinet at the Royal Danish Conservatory of Music in Copenhagen, Denmark, and former pupil of Aage Oxenvad and a comparison of the Published Version with the Manuscripts in the Danish Royal Library

This paper is a measure by measure summation of notes scrawled in my study copy of the Nielsen Concerto. These are instructions, expletives, and analogies made by Tage Scharff during my studies with him in the summer of 1979. Scharff was a student of Oxenvad 1940-1944. In addition, I have included a measure by measure comparison of the version published by Samfundet til Udgivelse af Dansk Musik in 1973 with the three extant manuscripts. I have compared only the solo parts; I did not have the time to make a study of the full orchestral score in manuscript. These manuscripts are all in the possession of the Royal Library in Copenhagen, which refused permission to make photocopies of the music because of instructions by the executors of the Nielsen estate. My study was therefore limited to notes I could make in my own study copy while sitting in the reading room at the library.

## CONVENTIONS

I will refer to the measures by page number, line number (counting from the top), and measure number in that line.

All of Scharff's comments will be labeled "**S**:"

Discrepancies with the three manuscripts will be cited according to the following designations:

- **MS I:** The earliest full score, in pencil
- **MS II:** Oxenvad's solo part in ink, with his own markings and performance notes in pencil
- **MS III:** The final manuscript score, prepared for the engraver (MS III is dated: Damgaard 15 August 28)

The reader is referred to my article in The Clarinet Volume 14 number 2 (Winter 1987) for a more general treatment of the work as well as historical and cultural background information.

- **PAGE 1**

- Line 1
  - mm. 17-18, **S:** breath marks after each of these measures  
**MS II:** mp instead of mf
- Line 2
  - m. 4, **S:** tenuto on high D flat
  - m. 5, **MS II:** no accent marks
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **S:** tenuto on high G flat  
**MS II:** no forte marking
  - m. 2, **S:** tenutos on high E flat and on D (beat 2)
  - m. 3, **S:** tenuto on first low B flat  
**MS II:** no molto indicated
  - m. 5, **MS II:** no breath mark at beginning of measure
- Line 4
  - m. 1, **MS II:** breath mark at end of measure
  - m. 3, **S:** staccato on first note, breath mark before second note, accent on second note
  - m. 4, **S:** accents on all three A flats
  - mm. 3-4, **MS III:** slur from first low F to last low G; slurs as in published version are penciled in
- Line 5
  - mm. 1-4, **S:** horizontal brackets over first eight notes, and subsequent groups of eight, indicating phrase groupings
  - m.4, **MS I III:** slur from beginning of this measure to end of next measure  
**MS II:** no slurs indicated  
**MS III:** slurs as in published version are penciled in
- Line 6
  - m. 3, **MS I II:** no slur
  - mm. 4-5, **MS I:** slur from low E to end of line  
**MS II III:** slur as in published version
- Line 7
  - mm. 1-4, **MS I:** no slurs
  - m. 5, **MS I II:** no sharp over trill symbol  
**MS III:** sharp sign penciled in
- Line 8
  - m. 2, **S:** first A sharp to be fingered xoo/oxo  
**MS III:** ff penciled in; no dynamic indication in other two MS
  - m. 6, **S:** use long fingering for high F sharp for maximum volume and stridency
- Line 9
  - m. 1, **MS I II:** slur breaks at end of measure; the first note in measure 2 is tongued  
**MS III:** slur as in published version
  - m. 2, **MS II:** fz is replaced by >  
**MS III:** fz as in published version

- **PAGE 2**

- Line 1
  - Above this line in MS I, written in pencil, is this quote: *"vildtforvirret i det noje leje og lilletrommen driver det frem; derefter [ ]"* - translated: *"wildly confused in the intimate exchange and the snare drum drives it forward; and then [Nielsen here wrote in the rhythmic motive which is in the accompaniment at rehearsal number 4]"*
  - m. 1, **S:** *"ugly!"*, first four notes to be played fast, next two (C sharp and G) are marked *"brake"* and are tenuto. fff is marked sempre  
**MS II:** ff instead of fff  
**MS III:** fff
  - m. 2, **S:** tenutos on the 2nd, 3rd, 8th, 12th, and 16th notes; breath mark after the last note (F natural); *"ugly!"*
  - m. 3, **S:** accents added to fz on high G and high E; slur is broken at end of line  
**MS I II:** accents on high G, high E and high D
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S:** first note is articulated  
**MS II:** accents on B (the 5th thirty-second note) and F (the 11th thirty-second note)
  - m. 2, **S:** staccato on last note (B)  
**MS I II:** accent on high F
  - m. 3, **S:** staccato on second note (F sharp), last four notes are slurred separately  
**MS I II:** accent on first note (D sharp)  
**MS II:** last four notes are slurred separately
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **S:** first note is articulated
  - mm. 1-5, **MS I:** no fz markings  
**MS II:** accents in place of fz markings
  - m. 4, **S:** fff marking inserted, indicating that the level has remained sempre fff since top of page, thereafter dim. to m. 6  
**MS II:** no dim.
  - m. 6, **S:** forte indication at beginning of measure
  - mm. 7-8, **S:** breath marks before each of the B flats, accents on each of the B flats, staccato on the last F  
**MS II:** above m. 7-molto dim.
- Lines 4 and 5 are labeled by Scharff: *"manic depressive"*
- Line 4, **S:** *like an object seen from three sides* (referring to the three phrases, which are variations of each other) also- *"improvisational"*. The first phrase peaks at the first note in m. 4, the second phrase at the first note in m. 6, the third phrase at the first note in m. 8
  - m. 3, **S:** the D flats are played with the side keys (trill fingering), to avoid the change of tone quality when using the third register
  - m. 8, **S:** the phrase which begins with C flat and continues through the F on the next line is labeled *"an afterthought"* referring to its relationship to the three preceding phrases
  - mm. 3-next line, **MS II:** the long phrase line is penciled in
  - m. 8, **MS II:** breath mark after quarter note F
- Line 5
  - m. 1, **S:** breath mark after the F; accent on C flat; cresc. deleted; mf under the C flat; cresc. indicated from mf to f in the next measure (the crescendo has been

moved to the phrase which begins on the C flat)

**MS I:** crescendo mark under the two sixteenth notes, the cresc. at the beginning of the measure is not there

- m. 2, **S:** staccatos on the two top line F flats, accents on C flat (third note) and C flat (seventh note)
- m. 3, **MS II:** calando is not indicated  
**MS III:** calando is penciled in
- m. 5, **S:** emphasize the first note "*like a downbeat*"; accent on first note; to be played "*lyrically and lovingly*"  
**MS I:** ppp is indicated

○ Line 6

- m. 1, **S:** "*calm before the storm*"
- m. 4, **S:** "*satanically*"
- m. 5, **S:** accents on G sharp and C; staccato on A  
**MS I II:** accent on G sharp
- m. 6, **S:** staccatos on G and D flat; accent on B  
**MS II:** slur from C of previous measure to D flat at end of measure 6  
**MS III:** slur as in published version
- m. 7, **S:** "*violinistically*" - meaning break after the low notes as a violin would when crossing the strings in such a wide leap; "*a struggle; should sound hopeless*"

○ Line 7

- m. 1, **S:** break after E; ff indicated under the thirty-second notes; "*fast*" written above the thirty-second notes  
**MS II:** molto indicated before dim.
- m. 2, **S:** p changed to mp; above the thirty-second notes: "*innocently*"  
**MS I:** under the C natural: quasi rall. p is pp
- m. 3, **S:** under E flat: p (as an echo of previous phrase)
- m. 4, **S:** under thirty-second notes: mp
- m. 5, **S:** under E flat: p

○ Line 8

- m. 1, **S:** accent on last note  
**MS I:** the long slur is not there
- m. 3, **S:** non cresc.  
**MS I:** slur from fifth note (G) to end of measure 4
- m. 5, **S:** C flat is fingered as in the B flat to B trill, then move the thumb to play to the B flat  
**MS I:** no accent  
**MS II:** accent is penciled in

○ Line 9

- m. 2, **MS I:** no accent  
**MS II:** accent is penciled in
- m. 4, **S:** "*satanically*"

○ Line 10

- m. 1, **S:** "*struggle*"; tenuto over the high F
- m. 2, **S:** under tied C flat: "*vöke!*" meaning "*away!*" or "*off!*"; breath mark after first note; tenuto on second note
- m. 3, **S:** from here to the end of the page, Scharff likens the intent to a "*seascape*" of complete calm, with an occasional fish jumping and causing a mild

disturbance. The thirty-second notes and grace notes are the fish; while the long notes are the calm sea.

- m. 5, **S**: breath mark after D  
**MS I**: no accent  
**MS II III**: accent penciled in
- m. 6, **S**: accent on F (it's a fish, in the seascape analogy)
- Line 11
  - m. 1, **S**: accent on grace note and on first thirty-second note  
**MS II**: accent on grace note  
**MS I II**: the long slur is not there
  - m. 2, **MS I**: no accent  
**MS II III**: accent penciled in
  - m. 3, **S**: accent on B
  - m. 4, **S**: accent on G sharp
  - m. 5, **S**: breath mark after B
  - m. 7, **S**: breath mark at end of measure

- **PAGE 3**

- Line 1

- m. 1, **S**: accent on first grace note and on the fifth note (A); "*not too weak yet;*" "*rhythmic!*"  
**MS I II**: accent on first grace note; the long slur is not present, instead, the slur breaks between the F sharp and the A, and again between the first two notes in m. 2
- m. 2, **S**: accent on first A  
**MS II**: slur from first A to breath mark in m. 3
- m. 3, **S**: "*completely flat*" meaning no rising and falling phrases until the fermata; accent on B flat  
**MS II**: slur from B flat to first note of m. 4
- m. 4, **S**: accent on C  
**MS II**: slur from C to fermata in next line
- m. 5, **S**: over last four notes: legato  
**MS II**: morendo is not present, rail. is in its place

- Line 2

- **S**: phrase group bracketed from low E to low F sharp (8 notes), breath mark after that F sharp, phrase group from low A to bottom line E natural (8 notes); over C sharp minor scale: "*Rip*"; over thirty-second rest: "*short*"; over B minor scale: "*Rip*"  
**MS I**: accent on the C sharp at beginning of the C sharp minor scale

- Line 3

- **S**: "*there is no interest in 'pretty'*"; over first rest: "*short*"; f changed to ff; accent on first note (this is the climax of the phrase); over second rest: "*long*"; over second group of notes: "*afterthought-tension*" (the first group of notes is played rapidly, the second more slowly; the phrases in the last half of the line are bracketed in groups of six notes each, with pauses marked after the low D sharp, after the third space C sharp, and after the first space F sharp (third note from end of line); accel. poco a poco from the beginning of the phrase to the eighth note in line 4, with the pauses becoming subsequently shorter; at beginning of this phrase "*hanging in the air*"  
**MS I**: no dynamic indications in this line  
**MS I II**: second half of line - slurred in groups of three, into the notes marked staccato; in MS II, however, Oxenvad penciled in the articulations as they appear in the published version; Oxenvad also wrote p under the second phrase and "cresc" near the end of the line  
**MS III**: articulations as in published version; p under second phrase penciled in

- Line 4

- **S**: the arpeggio should start slowly and accelerate to the top note "*like a ping pong ball bouncing*", and should be treated similarly on its descent; tenuto indicated on the first two notes of the ascending arpeggio (C sharp and E) and again on the first two notes of the descending arpeggio (G sharp and E); ten. on high C sharp is circled for emphasis  
**MS I**: three note slurs continue the 11th note of the measure, which is slurred through the 14th note; no accents appear in this line; no breath mark after the B; ten. on high C sharp does not appear; molto and ffz do not appear; slur breaks between low G sharp and A at end of line

**MS II:** cresc. penciled in at beginning of line; all accents appear as printed; high C sharp is a sixteenth note; ten. penciled in; fz on high C sharp

**MS III:** high C sharp is a sixteenth note; ten. penciled in

o Line 5

- **S:** tenuto indicated on first two notes of ascending arpeggio (D and F), and on first two notes of descending arpeggio (A and F); the F before the breath mark is staccato; the breath mark between the F and F sharp is a very brief pause, the following six notes are fast and "*frantic*", a "*contrast*" to the heavy and deliberate eighth and sixteenth notes which precede; the next group of six sixty-fourth notes begin "*frantically*" but ritard into the quasi rall.; the sixty-fourth notes from quasi rall. to pp in the next line are marked "*slow*" and "*should sound hopelessly impossible to play*" and "*inelegant*"

**MS I:** not accents, breath marks, or dynamic indications appear except the dim. at end of line; the slur is broken before the eighth-note B flat; C sharp at end of line is C natural

**MS II:** ten. penciled in; quasi rall. penciled in; sharp sign on C sharp at end of line penciled in

**MS III:** ten. penciled in, sharp sign on C sharp (end of line) penciled in

o Line 6

- **S:** pp circled; fermata over the breath mark following quarter-note D; over the ff sixty-fourth notes: "*cello spi*" (cello playing), and "*slow beginning*" meaning slow, broad-bowed notes as a cellist would play, accelerating some but not much; breath mark before the eighth-note B, this breath mark to be short; fermata over the breath mark following quarter-note F; breath mark at end of line deleted

**MS I:** the third note is F sharp; in the two groups of sixty-fourth notes marked ff the stems on the first two notes are down, the next two up, the next two down, etc.

**MS II:** the third note is F sharp; the stems on the sixty-fourth notes are as they appear in the printed version

**MS III:** the third note has been changed in pencil to F natural

o Line 7

- **S:** over the first four notes: "*aggressively*"; this line should be played rapidly and forcefully

**MS I:** on the first four notes in the second group of notes, the slur is absent and staccato is indicated; likewise on the next group; on the last group of eighth notes, the staccatos are absent and a slur is indicated through the fifth note of the next line

**MS II:** under the tenth note (B natural), a question mark is penciled in; the articulation through the rest of the line agrees with the printed version

**MS III:** the second and third groups of notes are marked two slurred, six staccato

o Line 8

- **S:** dim. and rail. are deleted; rail. is indicated after the breath mark; after the breath mark, the notes should not be counted, but should gradually die out [it is OK and desirable to play more notes than are written!; the soloist should "*play one more note than is possible*"; Tempo...72 is deleted; pp is changed to mp; pp under the last two notes in the line (as an echo of the preceding motif); crescendo

indicated on last note of line; in this passage there should be no tempo, the thirty-second notes should be flung "*like rice*", with a flourish

**MS I:** at Tempo...72, *molto tranq.:* is indicated

**MS II:** after *pp* a *diminuendo* to *ppp* is indicated

**MS III:** *ppp* is indicated instead of *pp*

- Line 9
  - **S:** *diminuendo* under first two notes; *mp* under first group of thirty-second notes; under the next sixteenth notes (as an echo again); *crescendo* from B flat to B natural, *diminuendo* from B natural to G; under the next series of sixteenth notes: "*searching, as in a labyrinth*"; breath mark after C sharp at end of line
  - MS I:** slur on last two notes in line is absent
  - MS II III:** slur on last two notes is indicated as in printed version
- Line 10
  - **MS I:** no slurs indicated; *lunga* indicated under *ppp*
  - **MS II:** all slurs as in printed version; *ppp* is absent
  - **MS III:** all slurs as in printed version



- **PAGE 4**

- Line 1
  - m. 2, **S:** "*flung like rice, non-metric*"  
**MS I:** ppp  
**MS II:** pp
  - m. 5, **S:** all of these entrances through m. 1 in the next line should be treated as downbeats
- Line 2
  - m. 4, **S:** "*square*"; breath mark end of measure  
**MS I:** no tenuto  
**MS II:** mp  
**MS III:** p
  - m. 5, **S:** breath mark end of measure  
**MS I:** no tenuto
  - m. 6, **S:** "*sempre p*"
  - m. 7, **S:** tongue first note  
**MS I:** tenuto on quarter note
- Line 3
  - m. 2, **S:** "*sempre p*"; tenuto on C
  - m. 3, **S:** accent F sharp  
**MS I:** no accents indicated
- Line 4
  - m. 1, **S:** Poco a poco accelerando should be at m. 2  
**MS I:** Poco a ... is at m. 2  
**MS III:** Poco a ... as in printed version
  - m. 3, **MS II:** accel. penciled in above B flat
- Line 5
  - m. 2, **MS II:** quarter note=144
  - m. 4, **S:** under G flat: "*bite in*"; accent and tenuto on G flat; quarter note=144  
**MS I:** quarter note=144  
**MS II:** in ink: quarter note=144; penciled in: quarter note=126 (I imagine to accommodate Oxenvad's more limited technic; this is in Oxenvad's hand!)
- Line 6
  - m. 1, **MS I:** eighth rest in place of the fifth and sixth notes  
**MS II:** in ink: the fifth and sixth notes are as in the printed version; penciled in: eighth rest  
**MS III:** eighth rest in ink; the two notes added in pencil
  - m. 2, **MS II:** slur from low C to high C of next measure
  - m. 3, **MS II:** tongue quarter note
  - m. 4, **MS I:** no breath mark; beneath measure: molto marcato
- Line 7
  - m. 1, **S:** accent on G flat
  - m. 4, **MS II:** tongue D flat; poco a poco accelerando penciled in
- Line 8
  - m. 1, **S:** big breath after trill; under the two thirty-second notes: "*fast!*"; above this measure: "*like Rimsky-Korsakov*"
  - m. 2, **S:** under this measure an arrow is drawn indicating a forward press into the next measure

- m. 3, **S:** "*as powerful as possible, as short as possible, as fast as possible, like hammer blows*"; delete "quarter note=72"; delete the breath mark  
**MS I:** Tempo I is absent  
**MS II:** Tempo I penciled in (the slowing here again was for Oxenvad)
  - Line 9
    - m. 2, **MS I:** first note is C natural  
**MS II:** C sharp penciled in
    - m. 3, **S:** breath mark and "*time*" indicated at the rest  
**MS I:** low G sharp in place of rest  
**MS II:** in ink: rest; in pencil: G sharp  
**MS III:** G sharp was originally there, but was later deleted and a rest written in (Scharff agreed that a breath was needed here)
  - Line 10
    - no comments or comparisons
  - Line 11
    - m. 1, **S:** staccato on high A flat
    - m. 14, **S:** rail. indicated just before the Poco Adagio
    - m. 15, **S:** quarter note=58
    - rehearsal number 12, **S:** "*labyrinth, a search*"  
**MS I II:** express. is absent  
**MS III:** express. is indicated
  - Line 12
    - **S:** at beginning of line: "*light and shadow*" - the pure intervals (fourths, fifths, triads) are lights of hope in the metaphorical labyrinth. These points of light Scharff indicated with arrows
    - m. 1, **S:** arrow on G
    - m. 2, **S:** breath mark affirmed  
**MS II:** no breath mark
    - m. 3, **S:** arrows on F and B flat; breath mark deleted  
**MS II:** no breath mark
    - m. 4, **S:** arrow on D flat; D flat to be played with side trill keys for the smoothness achieved by staying in the same register; the D flat is called a "*false hope*" because of the disappointing turn of the phrase in the following measures
    - m. 6, **S:** under first note: "*disappointed*"
    - m. 7, **S:** attention is drawn to this inverted quote of the opening motive of the Concerto; this quote dictates that the first note be tongued and the insertion of a slight lift (but no breath) after the first C sharp, and a breath after the half note  
**MS II:** no breath mark

- **PAGE 5**

- Line 1
  - m. 1, **S**: breath mark after second note
  - m. 2, **S**: tenutos on the first and eighth notes of the measure
  - m. 3, **S**: crescendo from last note of measure to third note of next measure  
**MS II**: no breath mark
  - m. 4, **S**: arrow on high C sharp; above that note: "*false hope*"; diminuendo from that note to the E; attention is drawn to the augmented fourth (the interval of darkness and disappointment) from the G sharp at the end of the measure to the D natural in the next
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S**: below first note: "*disappointment*"  
**MS I**: F sharp has no sharp sign  
**MS II**: sharp sign penciled in on F  
**MS II**: no sign of any kind indicated on F [your call]
  - m. 2, **MS II**: no breath mark
  - m. 3, **S**: crescendo from beginning of measure to B flat; arrow on that note  
**MS II**: the breath mark after the F is penciled in
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **S**: the rhythm should not be strictly observed (5-5-4), but should be a simple fourteen note *rallentando*  
**MS I**: the slur breaks at end of measure
  - m. 2, **S**: lift (but no breath) after eighth-note D; *p* is indicated  
**MS I**: tongue first note; no breath mark after dotted quarter-note D  
**MS II**: breath mark after eighth-note D; slur from dotted quarter note to eighth-note D in next measure
  - m. 3, **S**: breath mark deleted  
**MS I**: tongue first note  
**MS II**: breath mark deleted
  - m. 4, **S**: tenuto on last note (G)
  - m. 5, **S**: breath mark affirmed  
**MS I**: no breath mark  
**MS II**: breath mark penciled in after A flat; tie between the F flats (end of measure to next measure)  
**MS III**: *appassionato* indicated
- Line 4
  - m. 1, **S**: "*struggle with the intervals*"; weight on each note, no rushing; under last two notes of measure: "no dim."
  - m. 2, **MS I**: break slur at end of measure  
**MS II**: no breath mark
  - m. 3, **MS I**: tongue first note; slur over entire measure; no breath mark  
**MS II**: slur from third note to second note of next measure; no breath mark
- Line 5
  - m. 1, **S**: under first set of thirty-second notes: "dim."  
**MS II**: slur breaks after second note
  - m. 2, **S**: quarter note=84; "*begin slow-accel.*"
- Line 6

- In this section (lines 6 - 12) Scharff emphasizes the contrast between the seething, rhythmically active accompaniment and the soaring, legato solo. The clarinet plays entirely legato except for certain places where it breaks ("*air pockets*") to hear what is going on underneath, or occasionally participates in the accompaniment figure (lines 9 - 11)
  - m. 1, **MS I**: accent mark on B
  - m. 2, **MS II**: slur from B flat to breath mark in m. 4
  - m. 4, **S**: affirms breath mark ("*air pocket*")
    - MS I**: no slur for rest of line
    - MS II**: slur from E natural to breath mark in m. 6
  - m. 6, **S**: affirms breath mark ("*air pocket*")
  - m. 8, **S**: insert breath mark in place of first note (G flat)
- Line 7
  - m. 1, **S**: affirms breath mark; above this measure: "*svaev*" meaning "*float, hang, hover*"
    - MS I**: no slurs as in printed version in this line
  - m. 2, **S**: affirms breath mark
    - MS I**: no accent mark
    - MS II**: slur breaks at breath mark; slur from E to quarter note in m. 7
    - MS III**: slur agrees with MS II
  - m. 4, **S**: insert breath mark after first note; affirms existing breath mark
  - m. 5, **MS I**: slur from E flat to quarter note in next measure
  - m. 6, **S**: numeral 3 under sixteenth notes, indicating a triplet
    - MS II**: no breath mark
- Line 8
  - m. 3, **MS I**: no fz
    - MS II**: no fz; accent mark instead
    - MS III**: fz as in printed version
  - m. 4, **S**: suggests use of long fingering for F here and in subsequent measures as a timbre more homogeneous with the other notes
- Line 9
  - m. 1, **S**: breath mark after first note ("*air pocket*" again)
    - MS I**: no fz; accent mark instead
    - MS II**: accent mark as in printed version
  - m. 2, **S**: under the rapid notes: "*like a drum-mercilessly!*"
- Line 10
  - no comments or comparisons
- Line 11
  - no comments or comparisons
- Line 12
  - m. 1, **MS I**: no breath mark
  - m. 2, **S**: breath mark after first note ("*air pocket*")
  - m. 3, **S**: breath mark after first note; under this and m. 4: "*gradually smoother*"
    - MS II**: breath mark after first note; under this measure: "*poco a poco*"
  - m. 4, **MS I**: dim.
  - m. 5, **MS I**: no rall. or poco a poco dim.
  - m. 6, **S**: attention is drawn to the augmented fourth at the end of the measure with the note: "*the dark side*"

**MS I:** poco rall.

**MS II:** natural sign penciled in on C

- m. 7, **S:** quarter note=58

- **PAGE 6**

- About this section (lines 1-4), Scharff says "*It is searching for something which won't be found.*" Note how any positive direction is lost in the dissonant intervals at the end of line 4, and the Scherzo (line 5) finally just starts without any real preparation.
- Line 1
  - m. 3, **S**: crescendo and diminuendo on the G  
**MS I**: no slurs on this line
  - m. 5, **S**: tenuto on G flat
  - m. 6, **S**: "*enjoy the intervals*" (it's a major triad!)
  - m. 7, **MS III**: breath mark before the quarter note
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S**: under E flat: "*lovingly*"  
**MS I**: diminuendo from B flat to F natural  
**MS II**: crescendo from first note to C natural, thereafter diminuendo to F natural  
**MS III**: same as MS II
  - m. 2, **MS I**: at beginning of measure: p; then crescendo to second note of next measure; no breath mark; slur from F natural of previous measure to the last sixteenth note (E flat) of this measure; slur from high E flat to first D of next measure  
**MS II III**: crescendo as in MS I
  - m. 3, **MS I II**: f on second note
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **S**: lengthen the notes, as if "*seeking*"; attention is drawn to the diminished fifth (B flat to F flat)  
**MS I**: slur from A flat to C flat, otherwise no slurs in entire line
  - m. 2, **S**: emphasize "*each note*"; rall. is emphasized  
**MS I**: no rall.  
**MS II**: slur from high E flat to B double flat penciled in; rit. penciled in under the beginning of the diminuendo  
**MS III**: rall. penciled in
  - m. 3, **S**: insert "a" before "tempo"; existing articulation is deleted; slur from D of previous measure (after fermata) to F natural, from C to C flat, from A flat to G, from G flat to E flat, from D to D flat, and from B flat to A in the next measure (this articulation is consistent with that in the next line); admonishment for strict adherence to the notated rhythm  
**MS I**: no poco . . . rall.; rall. under last four notes  
**MS II**: the long slur breaks between the second and third notes (C and C flat); rall. above fifth and sixth notes  
**MS III**: slurs as in printed version
  - m. 4, **MS I**: dim.
- Line 4
  - m. 1, **S**: long pause after first note; tongue A flat; slur A flat to G; tongue F sharp; slur G to A of next measure; beneath the F sharp: "*slow*"  
**MS I**: no slurs in the first four measures of this line
  - m. 2, **S**: slur C to D; below this measure: "*search the intervals*"  
**MS I**: no a piacere

- m. 3, **S**: tenuto on the high D; above the major seventh (D to E flat in next measure): *"surprise"*
  - m. 4, **S**: *"brake"* for the diminished fifth (G to D flat); *"brake"* for the augmented third at end of measure (C sharp to F)  
**MS I**: no dim.
  - m. 5, **S**: the unstable intervals compound-a great slowing down for the two diminished fifths (E to B flat, G flat to C) and the final augmented fourth (A flat to D)  
**MS I**: slur from F to first note of next measure
- Line 5
  - m. 1, **S**: *"hand the note [D] to the first horn"*; under eleven measure rest: *"dance"*
- Line 6
  - m. 1, **S**: sempre p; be sure the staccatos are very short  
**MS I, II, III**: slur begins on third note; no staccato on that note
  - m. 2, **S**: arrow over C to middle of next measure, pointing right, indicating forward motion through the rest
- Line 7
  - m. 1, **S**: subito f
  - m. 7, **MS II**: cresc.
- Line 8
  - m. 3, **MS I**: f instead of ff
  - m. 4, **S**: on last four notes: *"violently!"*  
**MS I II**: cresc. on last four notes
- Line 9
  - m. 14, **MS I II**: slur breaks before E
  - m. 15, **MS I**: asterisk above measure refers to following note: *"can trill either to F sharp or F"*; there is no sharp sign above the tr  
**MS II**: no sharp indicated on tr  
**MS III**: sharp sign penciled in above tr
- Line 10
  - m. 1, **MS I**: slur breaks before A flat
  - m. 3, **S**: attention is drawn to the unstable augmented fourth (B flat to E)  
**MS II**: no dim.  
**MS III**: natural sign on E penciled in
  - m. 4, **MS I**: a flat sign added below the unmarked B  
**MS II**: flat penciled in on B; dim.  
**MS III**: flat penciled in on B
  - m. 5, **S**: *"don't ritard too soon; the orchestra has more to play after the F sharp"*  
**MS I II**: no tranq.
  - m. 6, **S**: rall.
- Line 11
  - m. 1, **S**: tenuto on first two notes; this measure is an *"important motive"* which figures prominently in the rest of the piece; should be treated as a *"song"*  
**MS I**: no mp espress.  
**MS II**: no cca. in metronome marking; p instead of mp [I think cca means "circa"]  
**MS III**: >mp espress. penciled in
  - m. 4, **MS I**: no breath mark

- m. 5, **MS II**: sharp sign on C sharp penciled in



- **PAGE 7**

- Line 1
  - m. 1, **MS I II**: no dim. or poco rall.
  - m. 2, **S**: side key fingering for D flat is suggested  
**MS I II**: dim. above third note; poco rall. below second note
  - m. 3, **S**: tenuto on first two notes (the motive from rehearsal number 23)
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S**: these notes must "*push through*" as a phrase into the next measure  
**MS I**: all notes slurred  
**MS II III**: articulation as in printed version penciled in
  - m. 3: **S**: same as m. 1
- Line 3
  - **MS I**: no slur in this line  
**MS II**: slur as in published version
  - **S**: m. 5: "*struggle*"  
**MS I II**: no accents indicated  
**MS III**: accents are indicated
- Line 4
  - **MS I**: no slur in this line
  - m. 1, **S**: tenuto on F sharp; rubato indicated
  - m. 2, **S**: breath mark on first note (tied F sharp)
  - m. 3, **S**: tenuto on high D and E flat with direction to "caress" these notes; below the measure, *fluyente* is circled and "flow" is added
- Line 5
  - m. 1, **S**: on last six notes: poco rall. to accommodate the thirty second note pickup in the viola just before measure 2; tenuto on high F
  - m. 2, **MS I II**: no "a tempo"  
**MS III**: "a tempo" is indicated, which makes requisite the poco rall. in the previous measure
  - m. 3, **S**: mf
  - m. 5, **S**: breath mark is moved to replace the tied A [breathe on count 1]; tenuto on B flat and E flat (the motive from reh. no. 23 again, the Perfect 5th must be emphasized)  
**MS I II**: no breath mark
- Line 6
  - m. 1, **S**: tenuto on first two notes; insert bar line before E  
**MS III**: *fluyente*
  - m. 2, **MS I**: no accents or marc.  
**MS II**: no accents, marc. is there
- Line 7
  - m. 7, **MS II**: slur breaks before C  
**MS III**: as in published version
  - m. 8, **MS I II**: no diminuendo  
**MS III**: diminuendo penciled in
  - m. 9, **S**: "*struggle with the intervals*"  
**MS II**: slur breaks before C; no breath mark  
**MS III**: as in published version
- Line 8

- m. 1, **S:** must sound "impossible to play"  
**MS I II:** no "cresc . . . f"  
**MS III:** "cresc . . . f" penciled in
  - m. 4, **S:** "searching, seeking" **MS I:** no slur  
**MS II:** no ff
  - m. 5, **MS I:** cresc. on last four notes
- Line 9
  - no comments or comparisons
- Line 10
  - mm. 1-4, **S:** tenuto on first note of each of the four measures, and instruction to "*bite in*"
- Line 11
  - mm. 1-2, **S:** tenuto on first note of each measure
  - mm. 3-4, **S:** regular fingering for all of the high Ds suggested, the passage must sound "*difficult*"

- **PAGE 8**

- Line 1
  - m. 3, **S**: "*searching, seeking*"  
**MS I**: the slur starts on the G natural
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S**: eighth note=126  
**MS II**: fz instead of ffz  
**MS III**: ffz at rehearsal number 30, **S**: "square notes"  
**MS I**: slur from E flat to E flat in next line, first measure  
**MS II** and **MS III**: no slur
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **MS I**: no accent
  - m. 5-6, 9-10, **MS I**: no slurs
- Line 4
  - **MS I**: no slurs
- Line 5
  - **MS I**: no slurs
  - m. 4, **S**: "non dim"; count this measure in four, to prepare for next measure  
**MS III**: rall. [concurrs w/ Scharff's directions]
  - m. 5, **S**: sixteenth note=176  
**MS I**: tempo tranq instead of Un poco meno, second note marked double sharp instead of sharp  
**MS II**: second note marked double sharp instead of sharp; sharp sign penciled in later [double sharp doesn't make sense]
- Line 6
  - m. 1, **MS I**: slur first six notes in two groups of three notes each; no other slurs later MS as in published version
  - m. 3, **S**: tenuto on G, F sharp, and F [the chromatically descending line]
  - m. 4, **S**: tenuto on E [continuation of above]
- Line 7
  - m. 1, **S**: tenuto on high C sharp
  - m. 2, **S**: poco rall. on last six notes
  - m. 3, **S**: at the scale: "*only virtuoso spot in entire work*"; breath mark after low F sharp  
**MS I**: above third note: "ad lib"; no slur  
**MS II III**: above third note: "cadenza"
- Line 8
  - **S**: under repeated high E's: "*satanically slow*"; breath mark with fermata between third and second notes from end of line  
**MS I**: no "ad lib con forza"; at end of line: "agitato"  
**MS II**: con forza shifted three notes to the right; accent on third note from end of line  
**MS III**: [this is important] breath mark with fermata ON the breath mark before second note from end of line
- Line 9
  - **S**: arrow pointed right from F through the rest to E, indicating forward phrasing and sustained tension into the low E; the low E's are a continuation in velocity and intensity of the notes before the fermata; the next two lines are comprised of alternating phrases which carry on a dialogue-Scharff has written a question mark

under the first group of twelve thirty-second notes (an upward direction melodically), and an exclamation point under the next group (downward melodically), question mark next, exclamation point next, etc. etc.; this dialogue begins slowly and accelerates as the note groups become shorter, however, the two thirty-second notes at the beginning of each group should be played as short, hard, and fast as possible each time, with the slurred notes gradually speeding up until, at the beginning of the bottom line, they become equal in duration

- Line 10
  - **S:** at beginning of line: "*whole thing moving now*"; arrow pointing right under entire line; breath mark at end of line  
**MS II:** breath mark between low A and top line F in second note group
- Line 11
  - **S:** "*equal now*", referring to speed of tongued notes and slurred notes

- **PAGE 9**

- Line 1
  - **S:** slur added from C to A flat (just right of middle of line); diminuendo should not start until just before the breath mark (at the syllable "e"); breath mark affirmed, take time here-; at the end of the line, when playing the repeated pattern of four notes (A-F-G-B flat), it is not necessary to play exactly four groups as is written-there should be as many as the performer deems necessary to achieve peace after the volatile cadenza, keep repeating the pattern  
**MS I:** slur added from C to A flat (middle of line); dim. under eleventh note; no diminuendo above line  
**MS II:** slur added from C to A flat (middle of line); no rall., yes, slur it!
- Line 2
  - m. 1, **S:** fermata on breath mark  
**MS I:** no dim.; add "molto rall". under fifth note; no breath mark; slur breaks at end of measure  
**MS II:** breath mark penciled in; slur breaks at end of measure  
**MS III:** breath mark penciled in; slur as in published version
  - m. 2, **MS I II:** first two notes are slurred together
  - m. 3, **S:** bracket from the first thirty-second note to the second note in the next measure, indicating an eight-note phrase grouping, bridging across the bar line. These eight-note phrase groups continue through the second high E in the Line 3 measure 2  
**MS II:** accent instead of tenuto on A
- Line 3
  - m. 1, **S:** third and fourth notes from the end of the measure are A naturals, a "printer's error" according to Scharff  
**MS II:** the two A flats above the staff are spelled as G sharps, the two F flats are spelled as E naturals.
  - m. 2, **S:** tenuto on first two notes and on the B natural and bottom space F sharp; cresc. continues from fz to first note in next measure
- Line 4
  - m. 4, **S:** "*strong but not violent, a 'Brahmsian forte'*"  
**MS I:** f instead of ff **MS II MS III:** ff
  - m. 5, **MS I:** no slur
  - m. 6, **S:** tenuto on high F flat  
**MS I:** slur breaks at end of line
- Line 5
  - m. 1, **MS I:** first notes tongued
  - m. 2, **MS II:** no breath mark
  - m. 4, **S:** the last sixteenth notes must be "*passed on*" to the two sixteenth notes that the first violins have at the end of the measure  
**MS I:** no dim. or poco rall.  
**MS II MS III:** dim. poco rall. are there
- Line 6
  - m. 1, **MS I:** no p
  - m. 2, **S:** crescendo is affirmed; a horizontal line is entered above the two Cs, indicating forward momentum in the phrase, in spite of the 16th rest  
**MS I:** no crescendo

- MS II:** crescendo is there
    - MS III:** crescendo begins on first count
  - m. 3, **S:** breath mark after C
  - m. 5, **S:** tempo indication: quarter note=152; crescendo should be poco
- Line 7
  - m.1, **S:** "*pale - a contrast to what is coming*"
  - m. 5, **S:** breath mark after G
  - m. 6, **S:** diminuendo from third note to next measure
  - m. 7, **S:** "*like a peasant dance - let it go!*"
- Line 8
  - m. 1, **S:** "*knife - raw - each note cuts*"
  - m. 2, **MS II:** no natural sign above tr  
**MS III:** natural sign penciled in
- Line 9
  - m. 3, **S:** suggests fingering high E flat: thumb, register key, and throat A key
  - m. 6, **MS I II:** fz at beginning of trill
- Line 10
  - m. 4: **MS III:** diminuendo after "f"
  - m. 6: same markings as on trill in Line 8
- Line 11
  - m. 1, **MS I:** the sixth note in the measure is high C sharp instead of F sharp  
**MS II:** same as in the published version  
**MS III:** was originally like MS I, but was changed to agree with the published version

- **PAGE 10**

- Line 1
  - m. 1, **MS I**: no p or poco a poco calando  
**MS II**: p is there, dim. instead of poco a poco calando  
**MS III**: p and poco a poco calando penciled in
  - m. 6-7, **MS II**: diminuendo is penciled in
  - m. 8, **S**: quarter note=88; large breath mark on quarter rest  
**MS I**: poco instead of molto; no "p espr."; no slur  
**MS II**: poco instead of molto; mf instead of p  
**MS III**: poco is crossed out and replaced by molto, "p espr." is there
  - m. 9, **MS I**: slur starts on A and continues to E in measure two of line two
  - m. 11, **MS II**: penciled in: slur breaks after G sharp [the tie is negated]  
**MS III**: the tie is there
- Line 2
  - **MS I**: no crescendi or diminuendi in this line  
**MS II III**: crescendi and diminuendi are penciled in
  - m. 1, **MS II**: tongue the grace note
  - m. 9, **S**: emphasize the diminished fifth
- Line 3
  - m. 4, **MS I MS II**: mf; no "poco a poco accel."  
**MS III**: poco a poco accel. penciled in
  - m. 6, **S**: accel. emphasized  
**MS II**: diminuendo on first two notes; crescendo on next two
  - m. 8, **MS II**: "accel."
  - m. 9, **MS I**: under diminuendo: "molto"
  - m. 10, **MS I II**: no Tempo I or allegro vivace
- Line 4
  - m. 1, **MS I**: no ff
  - m. 5, **S**: "raging"  
**MS II**: the last note in the measure has been changed to D, and "d" has been written in underneath  
**MS III**: last note is F sharp, but is circled. Who knows what they were thinking?
- Line 5
  - m. 3, **MS I**: no slur; no molto espressivo  
**MS II**: ff is added; no molto espressivo  
**MS III**: molto espressivo only
  - m. 9, **S**: staccato on last note [D flat]
  - m. 10, **MS I**: "*senza rall.*" is added; no "calando"
- Line 6
  - **MS II**: "*Un*" Poco Adagio
  - m. 1, **MS II**: slur breaks after last note
  - m. 2, **S**: tenuto on last note  
**MS I**: no breath mark; slur breaks after last note  
**MS II**: tongue first note, slur into next measure, as in published version, crescendo on last four notes
  - m. 3, **S**: attention is drawn to the beautiful modulation on this note; "*shine*"; Scharff advocates use of the side key D flat for matching timbre
  - m. 4, **S**: affirms breath mark

- m. 6, **S**: breath again at end of measure
- m. 7, **S**: side key D flat
- m. 7-8, **MS I**: no crescendo/diminuendo
- Line 7
  - m. 1, **S**: p affirmed; breath mark deleted  
**MS I**: no p; no breath mark; no poco a poco etc.  
**MS II**: slur breaks at breath mark; no poco a poco etc.  
**MS III**: "*poco a poco in - -*" is there
  - m. 2, **S**: "*non cresc.*"
  - m. 6, **MS II**: mp instead of p
- Line 8
  - m. 3, **S**: breath mark deleted
  - m. 4, **S**: breath mark after E; tenuto on G flat  
**MS I**: accent instead of fz on G flat
  - m. 5, **S**: tenuto on C; breath mark after C
  - m. 6, **MS II**: no breath mark
- Line 9
  - m. 1, **MS II**: no breath mark; an asterisk is inserted here which refers to the following exchange between Nielsen and Oxenvad, which is at the side of the page in their respective handwriting:  
**Nielsen**: "Dear O! How can you make it with the breathing here? God!"  
**Oxenvad**: "It will be alright. I'll figure something out."  
**Nielsen**: "Thanks! I thought you could!"  
**MS III**: the breath mark is penciled in
  - m. 2, **S**: "*in tempo*"
- Line 10
  - m. 5, **S**: breath mark after A flat  
**MS I**: no accent mark  
**MS II**: luftpause symbol ("railroad tracks") penciled in after A flat; fz on B double flat
- Line 11
  - m. 1, **S**: breath mark after A flat  
**MS II**: no rall.; luftpause ("railroad tracks") after A flat
  - m. 3, **S**: breath mark after first A flat  
**MS II**: no poco meno; luftpause after first A flat  
**MS III**: poco meno is there
  - m. 4, **S**: "*not too weak*"
  - m. 5, **MS II**: luftpause after first A flat, dim. under F
- Line 12
  - **MS I, II, III**: no breath marks in entire line
  - m. 2; **MS II**: no "calando" - etc.; dim. under A flat
  - m. 6; **MS II**: slur continues through here
  - m. 11, **MS II**: crescendo (penciled in)
  - m. 12, **MS II**: diminuendo (penciled in); at very end: pppp  
**MS III**: at very end: pppp